

From Atlanta to Alberta:  
The “Unbelievable” Odyssey of Annie Nelles Dumond;  
A Minor Literary Mystery Solved

James L. Murphy



Annie Hamilton Nelles Dumond has earned a niche in women's history by virtue of her autobiographical volume, *Annie Nelles; or, The Life of a Book Agent*.<sup>1</sup> The book is a fascinating, highly melodramatic account of her vicissitudes in peddling books throughout the Midwest during the 1860s, along with other dramatic events in a life worthy of a Thomas Hardy novel. In 1979, I was to write an introduction to the Arno Press reprint of this book but the effort was forestalled by the discovery that not only could virtually nothing be learned about Annie Nelles' subsequent life but it also proved impossible to document many of the details she so forthrightly provided about her earlier years.

For example, Annie's brother George Franklin Hamilton reportedly joined the Confederate army and rose to the rank of Brigadier-General [!] before being killed at Atlanta in 1864. No record for such a soldier exists.<sup>2</sup> Similarly, Annie reported that she married a Eugene Giles at the Episcopal

---

<sup>1</sup> Cincinnati, 1868, published by the author, reprinted 1980, New York, Arno Press. Other editions examined include 4<sup>th</sup>, rev., 1869, Cincinnati: Miami Printing and Publishing Co.; 5<sup>th</sup>, rev., 1892, St. Louis, published by the author, 1522 Lucas Place.; reprint of 1<sup>st</sup> ed., 1980, Arno Press, New York.

<sup>2</sup> The Georgia Dept. of Archives and History can find no record of any Confederate general with the surname of Hamilton. Carroll Hart, letter to the author, September 13, 1979.

church in Atlanta, September 17, 1846. Yet no Episcopal church existed in Atlanta before 1848.<sup>3</sup> Nor could any documentation be found for her subsequent misadventures, such as the dramatic visit of the legitimate Mrs. Eugene Giles Mason to her Cincinnati hotel room and the revelation that her husband was a bigamist. Nor could any record be found of her brief second marriage, to Frank C. Nelles, whom she claimed to have married in Chicago February 6, 1866, and subsequently divorced in Indianapolis.<sup>4</sup> Finding such major lacunae in Annie's story quickly put an end to plans for writing an introduction to her autobiography. Much of her tale, it seemed, was not only unbelievably melodramatic but factually unbelievable as well.

Actually, respected bibliophiles have long been uncertain how much of Annie's story to accept. No less an expert than Joseph Sabin thought the name Annie Nelles might be a pseudonym, and at least one present-day rare book dealer labels the book "likely fiction."<sup>5</sup> Beginning with Annie's attempts to earn a living as a book canvasser, however, greater verisimilitude takes hold, and now, after thirty years, I can not only affirm that much of that aspect of her autobiography is probably true, but also answer the question of what became of her in subsequent years.

Although documentation of the marriage or divorce of Annie and Frank Nelles has not been found, Annie provides enough information to identify Frank Nelles in the 1850 and 1860 censuses. By her account, she moved to 51 West Lake St., in Chicago, November 18, 1865. Here she met Frank C. Nelles, who held a responsible position with the street railway company. Nelles' father was dead but he had a mother and several brothers living in Waukegan and two married sisters in Chicago, one living on Milwaukee Ave., the other a Mrs. Spalding. Nelles had three children, the eldest aged 13 (one named Wallace and another Daniel) and he was over 40 years old at this time. A half-brother, Emsley Sunderlin, is also mentioned. These facts comport with the 1850 census entry for Francis Nellis of Waukegan, Illinois, aged 31 years, a laborer born in Canada, married to "Salina" with sons William W., aged 8 and Daniel B., aged 7, both born in Michigan. An Almira Nellis, aged 19, born in Canada is in the same household, and the adjacent household is of that of Peley Sunderlin, with son Elmsley, aged 10, born in Illinois. Next adjacent is the household of Edward R. Nellis, aged 24, born in Canada, presumably a brother of Frank. The 1860 census lists Frank Nellis and wife Selana, as well as children William W., Daniel R., and son Francis G., aged 6. (I am grateful to Kathleen McLaughlin of Bowling Green, Ohio, for providing information on Frank Nelles, his children, and ancestry.) Daniel and [William] Wallace Nelles as well as Emsley Sunderlin are briefly mentioned in Annie's autobiography.

### Variations on a Theme

Following the Cincinnati publication in 1868 of virtually identical 1st and 2nd editions of her autobiography, a 4th edition, revised, appeared in 1869. It was common to exaggerate the edition number during this period, to suggest large sales, so it is not surprising that no trace of a 3rd edition has ever been found. Of more interest are the editorial changes and additions that have been made in the 4th edition. While much of the text remains verbatim, virtually all details relating to Frank C.

---

<sup>3</sup> E-mail communication from Lara Lowman, St. Philips Cathedral, Atlanta, Ga., March 12, 2007.

<sup>4</sup> Willard Heiss, City of Indianapolis, Records and Microfilm, letter to author, October 17, 1979.

<sup>5</sup> Joseph Sabin, 1868, *Bibliotheca Americana* 13: 18. "A curious book indeed that may or may not be an autobiographical account of the author's life," according to rare book dealer Priscilla Juvelis, Inc. Priscilla Juvelis continues, "While the title offered here appears on University of Michigan's list of biographies and autobiographies of women, we can find no record of Nelles' life. The prose borders on turgid; the circumstances appear more than a bit disingenuous. Still, it is an interesting choice of career for a woman in 1867 – whether real or imagined." (<http://www.abaa.org/books/108241943.html>, viewed August 4, 2009)

Nelles have disappeared, including the specific reference to their marriage by Rev. Edgar J. Goodspeed at the Baptist Church in Chicago. Frank Nelles' irate housekeeper, Angeline Carney, Charles Alvord, and members of Frank's family completely disappear from the account. Annie's suicide note is addressed not to Frank but to her landlady, and it is the landlady who finds the drugged Annie. In Chicago, there is no meeting with Frank's employer, nor any further meeting with Frank. One has to wonder why these references to Frank C. Nelles and her second marriage were so carefully removed, especially since they are retained in the 1892 5th edition where Frank C. Nelles appears fictionalized as Frank C. Ford. The most likely reason is simply that they were not true.

This 5th edition, revised, was published by the author in Cincinnati and reprinted at 1522 Lucas Place, St. Louis in 1892. Although it comprised 458 pages, it actually contained no more information than the 1st and 2nd editions (385 p.). The story is presented in the guise of an "as told to" autobiography by Mrs. Minnie Ford, at the urging of her friend, Mrs. A.N.D. Names are changed, thus Frank C. Nelles becomes Frank C. Ford, and a closing poem to Frank C. Nelles is omitted. (The poem had been replaced in the 4th ed. by another, "To My Sainted Friends in Heaven," selected by Annie C. Nelles. Like the 2nd edition, the 5th ends with Annie returning from Springfield, Illinois, to La Porte, Indiana, and then to Indianapolis, to join her "little adopted darlings." In both editions a postscript places them "some time after," residing in a mansion near Lexington, Kentucky.

Not so in the earlier 4th ed., in which Annie leaves young Carrie and Willie with a farm family near Indianapolis and resumes book-selling in Marshall and Kosciusko Co., Indiana, and then Monroe Co., Michigan. At Coldwater, September 23, 1867, she is initiated into the Independent Order of Good Templars. Called back to Indianapolis by her attorney with papers regarding her Southern claim to the Hamilton family plantation, she decides to sell *History of Morgan's Cavalry and Life of Mr. Lincoln*. She canvasses in the Richmond, Indiana, area, selling the Masonic history and a book published in the interest of the Independent Order of Good Templars. She then canvasses Lewistown and Cambridge City, where she learns that Carrie had drowned in a well near Indianapolis, December 7, 1867. Carrie's death leads Annie to join the First Baptist Church of La Porte, Indiana, where she is baptized January 19, 1868, by Rev. J.P. Ash.<sup>6</sup> The 1st ed. of *Life of a Book Agent* had since been published and it is now the only book she canvasses. Taking Willie with her, Annie visits La Porte, then goes to Davenport, Iowa, where Willie is run down by a team of horses on the 4th of July and dies three days later.<sup>7</sup> The revised version of her autobiography is signed La Porte, Indiana, July, 1869.

These two versions differ widely, even wildly. The most likely theory is that Annie felt compelled to divest her story of fictional aspects such as the two children and the Kentucky plantation. The Davenport, Iowa, newspaper contains no mention of the tragic death of young Willie, and it is believed that he and the hapless Carrie are fictions.

### **Annie's Later Life**

Aside from the evidence of her whereabouts being suggested by the places of publication of Annie Nelles' later works, it has been difficult to find any trace of her. With the publication of her later works, beginning with *National Reform* in 1891, it was apparent, however, that she had remarried, and inclusion of "The Lord's Supper.—Jesus a Jew" in her *Church and Sunday-School Work* indicated

---

<sup>6</sup> A James P. Ash, minister, Baptist Church, is listed in the 1870 Census.

<sup>7</sup> There is no reference to this horrific event in the Davenport newspaper of July, 1868.

that her husband was Elder D.W. Dumond.<sup>8</sup> Research in St. Louis, where several of her publications were printed in the mid-1890s, failed to discover any trace of the Dumonds, and no association with the 1522 Lucas Place address given on the title pages has ever been found, although the handsome residence is still standing.

Very recently, the discovery of "Mrs. S. Annie Nelles" in Lyon Co., Kansas, marriage records has provided the clues necessary to document her later life. S. Annie Nelles and Henry M. Hicks married 17 January 1875. An 1875 Kansas state census lists S. Annie Hicks in Emporia, Kansas, aged 35 years, born in Georgia and removed from Illinois. Listed with her is Henry Hicks, a railroad laborer aged 35 years, born in Vermont. No more is known of Hicks, although he appears to be listed in White Pigeon, Michigan, in 1870, a railroad engineer, with wife Eunice and sons Albert and Harry. October 12, 1880, Annie married again, to Wilson Dumond. A few months earlier, the 1880 census lists them in Emporia West, she aged 40 years, widowed, born in Georgia, her father born in England and her mother born in France, which tallies with her autobiography; Wilson Dumond is listed as aged 39, a boarder, occupation nursery man, he and his parents born in Ohio. The same census lists W. Dumond, aged 36, dealer in nursery stock, in Cottonwood, Chase Co., Kansas, born in Ohio, his mother born in York State, no place of birth given for his father.

The day they were married, according to Dumond's Civil War pension application, the couple left Kansas for Texas. His pension papers indicate a highly peripatetic existence for the couple: they spent 1881 and much of 1882 in Texas, moving to Red Bluff, California, and then to Sacramento. In a letter to the Pension Bureau written from Sacramento, he mentions that his wife's publisher "was burned out, and her books are not in print, have not been for several years."<sup>9</sup> By March, 1890, the Dumonds were in Denver, where Daniel was explaining to the Bureau of Pensions that from the time of his discharge until 1882 he was in a canvassing business that kept him traveling and formed no acquaintances that could give testimony regarding his illness. His poor health was compounded by rheumatism and a fall from a building while living in Denver. He also mentions that 1891 found him in Fairfield, Illinois, and by 1893 Dumond was bedridden in Edgar, Nebraska, still trying to obtain an increase in his pension, indigestion and "a functional disturbance of the heart" being added to his physical complaints. November, 1894, saw Dumond back in California and we learn that his current pension was \$8 per month, also that he had only two remaining teeth. By June, 1897, the Dumonds had settled in Sabina, Ohio, where Dr. Phillip C. Cole described Wilson's "broken down condition of the nervous system causing a weak action of the heart, with shortness of breathing." By 1898 his pension had increased to \$12 per month; at 5 feet 7 inches in height, Dumond weighed only 140 pounds.

---

<sup>8</sup> National Reform or Liquor and its Consequence. St. Louis, 1522 Lucas Place, Published by the Author' Church and Sunday-School Influence. St. Louis, Published by the Author, 1895; The Hard Times: The Cause and the Remedy. St. Louis, 1522 Lucas Place, Published by the Author, 1895.

<sup>9</sup> D. W. Dumond, Pension papers, letter to L[afayette] Bingham, dated April 23, 1888. Dumond continued, "if you could help us to find a firm to take her books and publish them again and al[l]ow her a royalty it would be better than a pension, her two last books was lost before they left the bindery and it broke her up. She owns the 3 copyrights and would like to get a good firm to take them and publish them but we are poor and sick and can do nothing with the works, so they are out of print. Go to the Library and see her books, show them to Mr. Black {unidentified}, show him this letter...if you will read my wife's life which is her Life of a Book Agent, you will see she has not got a living relative on earth and you will see who she was, and where she was raised and the sorrow she has had, now she is a poor old broken down soldier's wife, her children are dead that she adopted, and she is a sad heartbroken woman in poor health. If you or Mr. Black could help her to get her books in print she would rather hav[e] it than a pension, for she is proud and did not want to ask the governmt to help us..." Bingham was a Washington, D.C., attorney who filed Dumond's 1886 claim.



### **The Ohio Connection**

By 1896 Annie Nelles Dumond was living in the small town of Sabina, Clinton Co., Ohio. Here she had purchased a lot on Sherman St., July 16, 1896, and built a white frame house. (Daniel Dumond was a carpenter by trade.) In an 1898 appeal to the U.S. Pension Bureau, her husband reported that "I cannot live on my present pension so I have tried this fall to do a little work to help out on our living and have completely broke down. Hear to fore my wife has furnish[ed] the deficiency of meanes with her labor in the book business but last Dec. she was stricken down with paralysis and is not able to do so any more so you see we are at your mercy."<sup>10</sup> Mitchell, Thirey and Helm's 1903 Historical Directory and Atlas lists Daniel W. Dumond, a minister, on Sherman St, and indicates that he served four years in Co. A of the 48th Indiana Volunteer Infantry. The 1900 census states that he was a carpenter, born May, 1844 in Ohio, father born in Ohio, and mother born in New York. Annie is listed as Anna N., born September, 1835, in Georgia, father and mother born in England and France, respectively. She is listed as having no children living or dead, even though her autobiography mentions a daughter who died at a young age. Brown's 1915 *History of Clinton County, Ohio* (p. 206) lists Anna Dumond as a charter member of the Sabina Chapter of the Order of the Eastern Star, although he gives an incorrect date for the installation meeting. Chapter records made available through the courtesy of Miss Linda Price indicate that Anna was elected warder for the Sabina Chapter November 14, 1901. February 3, 1902, it is noted that sister Anna Dumond is seriously ill and members are asked to help share taking care of her in her home.<sup>11</sup> Annie and her husband sold the Sabina property March 26, 1903, for \$1252 and there is no further record of her in Sabina--no death record, no obituary, no cemetery record, nothing. Once again she seemed to have vanished without a trace.

### **The End of Annie**

Combing through the microfilm of the two Sabina newspapers published during this period eventually revealed the final clue: a February 4, 1904, letter to the editor of the *Sabina News Record*. Dated January 13, 1904, and sent from Bullock[s]ville (later Content P.O.), Alberta, N. W. T., Dumond's letter deals mostly with the weather ("We had only one day when the mercury reached as low as 25 degrees below... The thermometer ranges near twenty above most of the time--just cold enough so it doesn't thaw. It is the most beautiful and pleasant winter I ever saw.") Dumond continued, extolling the advantages of the area and claiming his farm would be better than any in Clinton County. Strangely, there was no mention of Annie.

Initial inquiries at the Provincial Archives of Alberta yielded no concrete information in its genealogical resources until business manager Justin McLeod suggested a search of the Alberta homestead records. Expecting no more information than might be obtained from a deed record in the United States, I was elated to find Daniel W. Dumond's application for a patent to his farm, which not only contained detailed information on the farm itself but also mentioned the death of his wife on June 11th, 1903, four days before Dumond actually began residence at the farm site. Precisely where Annie

---

<sup>10</sup> D.W. Dumond pension file, letter dated September 19, 1898.

<sup>11</sup> D. W. Dumond's appeal to the U.S. Bureau of Pensions Board of Review, dated January 12, 1901, is especially pathetic: "You may think that I am somewhat impatient but sir if you could look in on us this morning and see how destitute we are this cold winter morning and see our condit. My wife very sick needing medical treatment the very worst kind and no means wherewith to get it. Myself broken down until I am not able to work not able to do anything so that those that hire will not give me work for they say that I cant earn my wages." Pension Claim No. 549,340.

### *The Unbelievable Odyssey of Annie Nelles Dumond*

died remains unknown, and her grave has not been located.<sup>12</sup> Daniel Dumond was still living on the farm in 1906 and apparently had remarried, as wife Lucinda, aged 68, is also listed in the census of that year, both having entered Canada in 1903.<sup>13</sup> No other reference to Lucinda Dumond has been found.

Daniel W. Dumond survived for nearly another two decades. Although his Alberta land patent was approved in 1907, 1910 found him living in Dawson, Montana, back with his first wife, Sarah, who died the following year.<sup>14</sup> Adjacent in 1910 was the family of their son, Henry H. Dumond., but by 1920 Henry H. was widowed and his father, Daniel, was living in the Montana Soldiers Home. Daniel W. Dumond died September 27, 1922, at the Battle Mountain Sanitarium of acute cardiac dilatation and is buried at the VA Medical Center, Hot Springs National Cemetery, Hot Springs, South Dakota.<sup>15</sup>

### **Epitaph/Epilogue**

If Annie Hamilton Nelles Dumond embroidered parts of her autobiography to what must even then have seemed an inordinate degree, her account of the trials of being a female subscription book agent rings true. In fact her verisimilitude has earned her a paragraph in Walter A. Friedman's authoritative history of salesmanship in the United States.<sup>16</sup> As melodramatic, romantic, and apparently unreliable the account of her early history may be, she was a pioneer, no less as a "female" (as they were then called) itinerant book seller, but as a chronically ill "senior citizen" (as they are now called) brave enough to set out with her husband to homestead in western Canada. And I confess a distinct pleasure experienced every time during the last thirty years whenever I was able to establish that Annie was telling the truth, no matter how unimportant the particular fact might be.

As for her last (I hesitate even to suggest a number) husband, Daniel W. Dumond's pension papers document an incredibly depressing account of a Civil War veteran trying to gain military benefits. (How few things really change!) If he embellished the facts a bit (when admitted to the Battle Mountain Sanitarium in 1912 his disabilities were listed as chronic gastritis, chronic bronchitis, arteriosclerosis, and varicose veins in both legs--I spare the reader the detailed list of ailments in his pension applications), Dumond surely deserved whatever care his country deigned to provide. At the end, despite years of petitioning, he was receiving only \$25.00 a month.<sup>17</sup>

When I think of Annie Hamilton Nelles Dumond, I am afraid my first thought is of the quaint engraving in her autobiography when, faced with the original (or at least an earlier) Mrs. Eugene Giles Mason, she exclaims in horror, with hand to forehead in astonishment, "If you are his wife, what am

---

<sup>12</sup> Province of Alberta, Homestead File 129998. According to his land patent application, Dumond had built "one good frame house and a log barn by August, 1904.

<sup>13</sup> Census Records of the Northwest Provinces, 1906. Alberta, Strathcona District, Subdistrict 16A, p. 6. Available online at <http://automatedgenealogy.com/census06/>

<sup>14</sup> Montana Office of Vital Statistics, 44-067, date of death February 25, 1911, age 63 years. According to the 1910 census, Daniel had been married four times: this would include Sarah, Annie Nelles, Lucinda, and Sarah.

<sup>15</sup> 1910 Federal Census, Dawson Co., Montana, E.D. 195, p. 65; U. S. Dept of Veteran Affairs website, [http://gravelocator.com.va.gov/j2ee/servlet/NGL\\_v1](http://gravelocator.com.va.gov/j2ee/servlet/NGL_v1)

<sup>16</sup> Walter A. Friedman, 2004, *Birth of a Salesman: The Transformation of Selling in America*. Harvard University Press, Cambridge.

<sup>17</sup> Historical Register of National Homes for Disabled Volunteer Soldiers, 1866-1938; (National Archives Microfilm Publication M1749, 282 rolls); Records of the Department of Veterans Affairs, Record Group 15; National Archives, Washington, D.C. Viewed on Ancestry.com. *U.S. National Homes for Disabled Volunteer Soldiers, 1866-1938*

*The Unbelievable Odyssey of Annie Nelles Dumond*

I?" But on reflection I don't care (and have never been able to prove) whether there ever was a Eugene Giles Mason. When I think of Annie Nelles, I think of an indomitable spirit, worthy of a movie or at least a television soap. As for her literary output, aside from her autobiography, the less said the better. There is a lot of temperance literature and she was relatively early in the field. Perhaps the most intriguing of her works is *Happy at Last, or A Sequel to The Life of a Book Agent*. Especially intriguing since it appears to be the title completely destroyed in a fire at her publisher's. Because no copies are known to have survived, we have no way of knowing how much her presumably fictionalized ending might have differed from the actualities of her later life. Sadly, it does not appear that she was "happy at last," for there was no happy ending in either Sabina or Alberta.

When I think of the Dumonds together, I think of their resilience in the face of grinding poverty and illness. I wonder, of course, how they related to one another one and particularly how they got along with their neighbors in Sabina. Were they able to pass off their abject poverty as merely genteel poverty? And what brought them to Sabina in the first place? It is all too clear what forced them to leave, but what made them choose Alberta, Canada? (In the 1880s they had tried farming in Tehoma Co., California, but were "obliged to sell out, not being able to perform the required labor.")<sup>18</sup>

From not being certain Annie Nelles even existed to now being able to document some of the events of her later life and her demise has been a long genealogical journey for me, though no longer than her real-life journey from Atlanta to Alberta. In the end, I am left thinking that the Dumonds were two very brave and resourceful people whom I might well have liked to know.

**Publications of Annie Nelles Dumond**

1868 - *Annie Nelles; or, The Life of a Book Agent. An Autobiography*. Published by the author. Entered... 1867 by Annie Nelles, in the Clerk's Office of the District Court of Indiana.

1869 - *Annie Nelles; or, The Life of a Book Agent. An Autobiography*. 4th ed., rev. Miami Printing and Publishing Company, Cincinnati. Entered, according to Act of Congress... 1867, by Mrs. Annie Nelles, in the Clerk's Office of the District Court of Indiana. Preface signed Laporte, Indiana, September, 1869.

1869- *Scraps; or Sabbath-School Influence*. Miami Printing and Publishing Co., Cincinnati. Entered...1868 by Mrs. Annie Nelles, in the Clerk's Office of the District Court for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania. Preface signed Laporte, Indiana, November, 1869.

1872 - *Ravenia; or, The Outcast Redeemed*. Commonwealth Printing Company's Press, Topeka, Kansas. Entered... 1872, by Mrs. Annie Nelles, in the Clerk's Office for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania. Preface signed, Topeka, Kansas, May, 1872.

1891 - *National Reform or Liquor and Its Consequences*. Published by the author, 1522 Lucas Place, St.. Louis. Copyrighted by Mrs. Annie Nelles Dumond.

Ca. 1881 - *Happy at Last; A Sequel to The Life of a Book Agent*. St. Louis (?). Not seen.

---

<sup>18</sup> Dumond's pension file, Affidavit of neighbor John Clements, Red Bluff, California September 6, 1886.

*The Unbelievable Odyssey of Annie Nelles Dumond*

1892 - *The Life of a Book Agent, 5th ed. revised*. Published by the author, 1522 Lucas Place, St. Louis. Entered... 1867 by Mrs. Annie Nelles, in the Clerk's Office of the District Court of Indiana. Author's name given as Annie Nelles (Dumond).

1895 - *Church and Sunday School Influence*. Published by the author, St. Louis. Copyrighted 1895 by Annie Nelles Dumond. Includes "The Lord's Supper.- Jesus a Jew," by Elder D.W. Dumond.

1895 - *The Hard Times: The Cause and the Remedy*. Published by the author, 1522 Lucas Place, St. Louis. Entered... 1895, by Mrs. Annie Nelles Dumond, in the Office of the Librarian of Congress.

1896 - *Christlike: Save the Fallen*. Published by the author, St. Louis. Copyrighted 1896 by Annie Nelles Dumond.

1980 - *Annie Nelles; or, The Life of a Book Agent. An Autobiography*. Arno Press, New York. Entered... 1867 by Annie Nelles, in the Clerk's Office of the District Court of Indiana. Reprint of the 1868 edition.

---



The Ohio Genealogical Society  
3<sup>rd</sup> Annual Writing Contest - Judging Criteria

Article Title: **From Atlanta to Alberta: The "Unbelievable" Odyssey of Annie Nelles Dumond**

Author: James L. Murphy

Appropriate OGS Journal: OGS Quarterly

<p>1. Accuracy (1-15)</p> <p>Do all the factual statements appear to be accurate? Watch for genealogical and historical errors. Are sources used cited correctly?</p>	<p>Score: <b>15</b></p> <p>Comments: Pays careful attn to historical accuracy, places info in historical context &amp; is well documented &amp; cited.</p>	
<p>2. Clarity - Writing mechanics (1-20 points)</p> <p>Evaluate the clarity and flow of the writing. Are the author's thoughts well-organized? Check grammar, syntax, spelling (but allow for variant spellings and for non-American spelling), punctuation, and word usage. Deduct for clichés, qualifiers, platitudes, overused words, and excessive punctuation.</p>	<p>Score: <b>18</b></p> <p>Comments: Engaging &amp; well written. As a reader I would have liked approx. dates she lived presented early on. Comparing editions was an interesting approach, but I was initially confused b/c it almost sounded as if someone else was making the changes →</p>	
<p>3. Overall impact and interest (1-15 points)</p> <p>Evaluate the article's depth and insight, and the writer's ability to capture the subject. Give points for uniqueness, drama, and creativity in telling the story or reporting the facts.</p> <p>This section also reflects the judge's subjective response to the story. Does it stand out from the others?</p>	<p>Score: <b>13</b></p> <p>Comments: End of article brought it all together. Appreciated the author's persistence &amp; looking for marriage &amp; death info beyond typical records, using pension apps &amp; land patents. Shift from 3rd p → 1st</p>	
<p>Judge #</p> <p style="text-align: center;">1   2   3   4   5   6   7   8   9</p>	<p>Total Score:</p> <p>Out of 50 possible points</p>	<p><b>46</b></p>

at the end -- effective device.  
Liked Visuals as well.

instead of presenting the changes as questions  
as to what the author might be

saying or not saying in revisions.

The absence of a husband's name  
seems perfectly rational after a  
divorce, instead of it was taken out  
because it probably wasn't true.

Perhaps this section could be used to  
raise questions of her intent & what  
that might tell us about her.

The Ohio Genealogical Society  
3<sup>rd</sup> Annual Writing Contest - Judging Criteria

Article Title:

**From Atlanta to Alberta: The "Unbelievable" Odyssey of Annie Nelles Dumond**

Author: James L. Murphy

Appropriate OGS Journal: OGS Quarterly

<p>1. Accuracy (1-15)</p> <p>Do all the factual statements appear to be accurate? Watch for genealogical and historical errors. Are sources used cited correctly?</p>	<p>Score:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">10</p>	
<p>2. Clarity - Writing mechanics (1-20 points)</p> <p>Evaluate the clarity and flow of the writing. Are the author's thoughts well-organized? Check grammar, syntax, spelling (but allow for variant spellings and for non-American spelling), punctuation, and word usage. Deduct for clichés, qualifiers, platitudes, overused words, and excessive punctuation.</p>	<p>Score:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">10</p>	
<p>3. Overall impact and interest (1-15 points)</p> <p>Evaluate the article's depth and insight, and the writer's ability to capture the subject. Give points for uniqueness, drama, and creativity in telling the story or reporting the facts.</p> <p>This section also reflects the judge's subjective response to the story. Does it stand out from the others?</p>	<p>Score:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">15</p>	
<p>Judge #</p> <p style="text-align: center;">1   2   3   4   5   (6)   7   8   9</p>	<p>Total Score:</p> <p>Out of 50 possible points</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">35</p>